



Municipalities building a stable insurance future.

125 East Court Street  
Ithaca, NY 14850  
607-274-5590  
INFO: consortium@twcny.rr.com  
www.tompkins-co.org/healthconsortium

**Approved**

**MINUTES**  
**Greater Tompkins County Municipal Health Insurance Consortium**  
**Joint Committee on Plan Structure and Design**  
**April 3, 2014 – 2 p.m.**  
**Old Jail Conference Room**

**Present:**

**Municipal Representatives: 8 members**

Michael Murphy, Village of Dryden; Brooke Jobin, Tompkins County; Steve Thayer, City of Ithaca; Jennifer Case(excused at 2:45 p.m.), Town of Dryden; Judy Drake, Town of Ithaca; Peter Salton, Village of Cayuga Heights; Carissa Parlato, Town of Ulysses; Joan Mangione, Village of Cayuga Heights

**Municipal Representative via Proxy: 4**

Don Barber, Town of Caroline; Mack Cook, City of Cortland; Betty Conger, Village of Groton; Laura Shawley, Town of Danby

**Union Representatives: 8 members**

Scott Weatherby, TC3 Staff Unit CSEA Vice President; John Licitra, Town of Ithaca, DPW – Teamsters; Olivia Hersey, TC3 Professional Admin Assoc. Unit; Doug Perine, White Collar CSEA #1000 Unit President; Tim Farrell, City of Ithaca DPW; June Overslaugh, City of Ithaca Admin. Unit; Derek Reynolds, City of Cortland Firefighters; James Bower, IUOE Local 158, District 832 Bolton Point

**Union Representative via Proxy: 4**

Jerry Wright, Cayuga Heights Police Benevolent Association; Scott Ochs, TC3 Faculty Association President; Steve Wright, Tompkins County Blue Collar Unit; Tim Logue, City of Ithaca Exec. Unit;

**Others in attendance:**

Steve Locey, Locey & Cahill; Beth Miller, Excellus; Sharon Dovi, TC3; Ashley Ahmadipour, ProAct; Margaret Gannon, CSEA

**Call to Order**

Mr. Weatherby called the meeting to order at 2:04 p.m.

**Chair’s Report - Executive Director Update**

It was reported by Mr. Weatherby that a Request for Proposals was issued for an Executive Director of the Consortium and updates will be provided as the process moves forward.

**Consultant Update**

**Approval of Unique Plan for the City of Ithaca**

Mr. Locey reported at the last meeting he distributed copies of standard plan designs and he would like this to move forward to the Board of Directors for consideration. Another item

he would like to have moved forward is a request from the City of Ithaca for a new plan which is time sensitive. He distributed a memorandum outlining a request by the City and the history behind it. He reviewed the background and explained the 3-tier drug formulary and how it typically defines the three tiers and how ProAct doesn't categorize them in the same way. The City of Ithaca has requested to have a unique plan approved just for one bargaining unit for the rest of this contract that would have a different formulary than others in the Consortium. He said the Consortium is being asked to approve this one-time unique benefit plan which would comply with the Fire Fighters Association, IAFF Local 737 collective bargaining agreement with the City. There are a couple of steps that have to be taken – the Board of Directors will need to approve the plan and then it will need to go to the New York State Department of Financial Services for its approval before it can be implemented.

It was MOVED by Ms. Hersey, seconded by Ms. Drake, and to recommend the approval of the City of Ithaca's request for a one-time unique benefit plan for the City.

Mr. Logue questioned the \$1,300 cost difference and where it would be made up. Mr. Locey there is no expense to the Consortium. He said it is a difference is in co-pays. The cost would be made up between the firefighters who paid the two-tiered co-pay who should have paid the three-tier copay based on the contract language and those who paid three-tier copays instead of two-tier copays; therefore, some will pay more and some will pay less. He noted this unique plan design is in response to that bargaining unit's request.

The motion was unanimously recommended by members present and will move forward to the Board of Directors for approval.

### **Approval of Amended Bylaws**

Ms. Hersey explained the history behind the proposal to amend the bylaws and reviewed suggested changes. It was determined that the since the document had not been reviewed since the Committee was first created and there were aspects within the document that were missing or needed revisions. She and Mr. Licitra volunteered to review the document and make suggestions; Mr. Barber and others have also provided input into the revised document. She said the Municipal Cooperative Agreement (Section K) outlines the creation of the Committee and how the Chair and Vice Chair are selected.

Mr. Reynolds said the reference to release time being granted by employers for members to attend meetings is no longer addressed in the document. Ms. Hersey said it would be a situation between supervisors and employees as to how that works. Mr. Locey said the Consortium cannot dictate to any employer how they need to act with regard to their relationship with their collective bargaining units. The Municipal Cooperative Agreement does not contain any language as to release time being provided to employees. The previous bylaws did contain language relating to this but the Committee did not have the authority to make that decision and the document was not approved by the Board of Directors.

Mr. Reynolds said management at the City of Cortland has given its approval of paid release time; however, the City Mayor and City Council have denied it. He said this is why other labor representatives from the City have not attended meetings. Mr. Weatherby said he will try to work on this and will continue to talk to the Mayor about this.

It was agreed to include the following language: "There should be a good faith effort by management and labor for all to attend and participate."

It was stated that once the amendment to the Municipal Cooperative Agreement is approved by all municipalities concerning labor representation on the Board of Directors it will be incorporated into this document and the bylaws will be presented again to accept that as an addition to the bylaws.

It was MOVED by Mr. Licitra, seconded by Mr. Murphy, and unanimously adopted by voice vote by members present, to approve the revised bylaws.

### **Joint Committee on Plan Structure and Design Bylaws**

1. The Joint Committee will consist of one representative from each bargaining unit with enrollees covered by the Consortium plans and one representative from each of the participating municipalities.
2. The purpose of the Joint Committee will be to review all prospective Board actions in connection with the benefit structure and design of the plans offered by the Consortium in order to develop findings and shall make recommendations to the Board with regard to such actions.
3. The Joint Committee has the authority to: be involved in reviewing benefits; investigate creative program designs for optimal use of resources; receive (quarterly ) reports regarding use of benefits, UCR changes, and potential cost increases; compare benefits and costs about any carrier change; gather information about benefits, service levels, and related program costs.
4. The Joint Committee's findings and recommendations with respect to benefit structure and design issues are presented to the Consortium Board of Directors through the Committee Chair who is a Director.
5. All Joint Committee actions shall be by a majority vote of a quorum which is defined as one-third of the municipal membership and one-third of the union membership.
6. Members who are unable to attend meetings may submit a completed proxy form or e-mail the Consortium's Administrative Clerk prior to the meeting. If notifying by e-mail the member must provide the date of the meeting they will not be attending and the individual to whom they are designating as the proxy.
7. Each January the Joint Committee Chairperson will be elected by a majority of a duly convened quorum of the Joint Committee and must be a union representative on the Joint Committee. The Vice-Chairperson of the Committee will also be elected by the Joint Committee and must be a representative from one of the participating municipalities.
8. The Joint Committee Chairperson will serve as a voting Director on the Consortium Board of Directors, representing Labor. The Labor representatives, only, of the Joint Committee will elect from among the Labor representatives at-large voting Labor Member to the Board of the Consortium to represent Labor. If the number of participating municipalities in the Consortium increases to 17, the Labor representatives, only, of the Joint Committee will elect from among the Labor representatives a second at-large voting Labor Member to the Board of the Consortium to represent Labor.
9. If any point in the year, the Joint Committee Chairperson or Vice-Chairperson, or the at-large voting Labor Member to the Board of the Consortium resign, retire or are otherwise are not eligible to continue, elections will be held at the next Joint Committee meeting to fill the vacant position.

10. Bargaining unit representatives will be the president of each bargaining unit or that persons' designee from the unit. Management representatives will be appointed by the respective elected leader of each participating municipality. (The term of appointments will vary according to the pleasure of the appointing authority).

11. The Joint Committee meetings will be scheduled at dates, times and locations agreed upon by consensus for future meetings. The meeting agenda will be made available 1 week prior to each meeting. There should be a good faith effort by management and labor for all to attend and participate.

12. Consortium's Administrative Clerk will be responsible for distributing agendas and handouts, scheduling meetings, taking notes, creating draft minutes and posting materials on the GTCMHIC website.

13. The rules contained in the current edition of Robert's Rules of Order Newly Revised shall govern the Joint Committee in all cases to which they are applicable and in which they are not inconsistent with these bylaws and any special rules of order the Joint Committee may adopt.

#### **Approval of Minutes – February 6 and March 6, 2014**

It was MOVED by Ms. Hersey, seconded by Mr. Farrell, and unanimously adopted by voice vote by members present, to approve the minutes of the February 6 and March 6, 2014 meetings as submitted. MINUTES APPROVED.

#### **Plan Designs**

Mr. Locey said they would like to have some plan designs approved that follow the form of the Affordable Care Act and which are at the different medal levels. He distributed sample plans from the Platinum, Gold, Silver, and Bronze levels which are the standard plan designs through Excellus Blue Cross Blue Shield and have all been rated out and fit the definition of the different medal levels. He said the Platinum plan is designed to cover 90% of the average person's medical care within a year; Gold is 80%, Silver is 70%, and Bronze is 60%. If the Employer mandate stays in effect the minimum requirement for an employer to offer coverage is at the Bronze level. There is no one in the Consortium who is currently offered a plan at this level and this is something that would have to be provided to an individual who is not in a bargaining unit or it would have to collectively bargained. The employer mandate is scheduled to go into effect on January 1, 2015.

Mr. Locey asked that the Committee consider recommending that the Board accept a standard plan at each of the medal levels. He noted this does not eliminate any of the existing plans and only makes some additional plans available for possible negotiation in the future. Until a time when labor and management agree to a change in a plan these plans would not be in effect for anyone, they would only be available as additional plan options through the Consortium. He said they are trying to meet the needs of the various employers within the Consortium and want to make sure there are enough plans available to provide a menu of options that be chosen from.

Mr. Locey responded to a question of whether the Consortium would consider a two-person rate. He referred to the Consortium's costs over the last two years on an age-band basis and stated in health insurance the number of people covered does not matter as much as the age and health status. Mr. Salton asked that Mr. Locey provide him with the numbers showing how the rates are calculated.

Ms. Gannon said Excellus has a better Platinum plan that the one presented by Mr. Locey. He responded that he did the analysis on the Platinum plans that Excellus has, along

with the premium differential for each of them, and there is less than a one percent difference in premium. She said is concerned that these plans would be the topic of discussion during collective bargaining sessions. Mr. Locey said if the Consortium does not offer these types of plans at the different levels people are going to start to look outside the Consortium for them because they are available in the marketplace. He said if they can be offered through the Consortium there can be some control and the Consortium can be kept together. If people start going outside the Consortium it will begin to fragment and that would not be good. He will share all of the medical options at a future meeting.

Mr. Licitra was excused at this time.

Ms. Miller said in order to protect itself the Consortium needs to have plans available under the umbrella of the Consortium that meet the requirements of the Affordable Care Act regardless of whether they are used.

The Committee will continue to discuss plan designs at the next meeting.

### **New Business**

Mr. Reynolds requested that Mr. Weatherby attend a City of Cortland Council meeting to talk about the Committee and to encourage management to support release time for the City's labor representatives to attend meetings.

There was no new business.

### **Old Business**

There was no old business.

### **Next Meeting**

The remainder of the meetings for 2014 will be held at 2 p.m. in the Rice Conference Room at the Public Health Department, 55 Brown Road, Ithaca.

### **Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 3:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by Michelle Pottorff, Administrative Clerk